

SHELDON WHITEHOUSE, RHODE ISLAND, CHAIRMAN
PATTY MURRAY, WASHINGTON
RON WYDEN, OREGON
DEBBIE STABENOW, MICHIGAN
BERNARD SANDERS, VERMONT
MARK R. WARNER, VIRGINIA
JEFF MERKLEY, OREGON
TIM KAINE, VIRGINIA
CHRIS VAN HOLLEN, MARYLAND
BEN RAY LUJÁN, NEW MEXICO
ALEX PADILLA, CALIFORNIA
CHARLES E. GRASSLEY, IOWA
MIKE CRAPO, IDAHO
LINDSEY O. GRAHAM, SOUTH CAROLINA
RON JOHNSON, WISCONSIN
MITT ROMNEY, UTAH
ROGER MARSHALL, KANSAS
MIKE BRAUN, INDIANA
JOHN KENNEDY, LOUISIANA
RICK SCOTT, FLORIDA
MIKE LEE, UTAH

United States Senate

COMMITTEE ON THE BUDGET
WASHINGTON, DC 20510-6100

TELEPHONE: (202) 224-0642

DAN DUDIS, MAJORITY STAFF DIRECTOR
KOLAN DAVIS, REPUBLICAN STAFF DIRECTOR
www.budget.senate.gov

June 9, 2023

Mr. Timothy M. Sweeney
President & Chief Executive Officer
Liberty Mutual Insurance
175 Berkeley Street
Boston, Massachusetts 02116

Dear Mr. Sweeney:

The United States Senate Committee on the Budget has recently held a series of hearings examining the economic risks associated with climate change.¹ In these hearings, central bankers, economists, insurance industry executives, financial experts, and others have testified that climate change poses multiple “systemic risks” to the economy. As you know, systemic risks cascade out of immediately affected sectors of the economy to do harm not only nationwide but also globally.

Witnesses have warned that sea level rise and wetter, more intense storms could eventually make more than \$1 trillion in coastal real estate uninsurable, and therefore unmortgageable, leading to a coastal property values crash; that more frequent and intense wildfires could result in a similar death spiral for Western property in the wildland-urban interface; that climate-related losses are making it harder for the insurance industry to price risk, already resulting in insolvencies among regional insurers; and that, as demand for oil and gas declines, hundreds of billions of dollars in fossil fuel assets may be stranded (the “carbon bubble”). Each of these disruptions could become “systemic,” and more than one could occur simultaneously.

We write to inquire how the U.S. insurance industry, specifically Liberty Mutual Insurance (Liberty Mutual), evaluates these climate-related risks, decides to invest in or underwrite fossil fuel expansion projects that drive such risks, and prices policies insuring such projects. Underwriting and investing in dangerous fossil fuel projects makes it harder to achieve global climate goals, and there is little transparency about how the myriad risks factor into industry decisions.²

As you know, 195 world leaders signed the Paris Agreement in 2015, committing their countries to pursue efforts to limit temperature increases to 1.5°C above pre-industrial levels. Since that time, respected international bodies like the International Energy Agency and

¹ Hearings.” U.S. Senate Committee On The Budget. Accessed June 6, 2023. <https://www.budget.senate.gov/hearings>.

² “Home.” Oil Gas Policy Tracker, May 2, 2023. <https://oilgaspolicytracker.org/>.

United Nations (UN) have stated that new coal, oil, or gas development is incompatible with that global goal and, indeed, that production of these fossil fuels must decrease each year. The UN recommended that production of coal, oil, and gas decline by 11%, 4%, and 3%, respectively, every year through 2030.³

Despite these prudent recommendations based on well-established climate science, U.S. insurance companies continue to underwrite coal, oil, and gas projects and invest in the oil and gas industry. U.S. insurers currently have approximately \$582 billion invested in fossil fuels—with nearly \$90 billion in coal alone.⁴ Globally, some insurance companies like Allianz, Munich Re, and AXA have begun restricting their underwriting of certain coal, oil, and gas projects.⁵ But in the United States, the insurance industry continues to support existing and expanded fossil fuel projects with few restrictions in place limiting—or excluding—either. In short, U.S. insurers continue to underwrite polluting projects while making investments in an industry whose continued expansion poses multiple serious dangers to overall economic stability and to insurance services in particular.

While the U.S. insurance industry invests in and underwrites fossil fuel projects that are driving the climate crisis, it simultaneously faces rising costs due to climate disasters. For example, insurers are greatly raising rates and even pulling out of the home insurance market in Florida and Louisiana, in part due to climate-driven hurricanes.⁶ In California, wildfires have caused significant turbulence in the state’s insurance market, with non-renewals of residential insurance policies jumping 31% in 2019 and annual premiums increasing by thousands of dollars.⁷ Some insurers even recently announced that they would completely cease accepting new applications on business and personal property lines anywhere in the state, citing rapidly growing catastrophe exposure as one of the reasons.⁸ Additionally, the Treasury Department has

³ “2021 About.” Production Gap, October 20, 2021. <https://productiongap.org/2021about/>.

⁴ “U.S. Insurance Companies Have \$582 Billion Invested in Fossil Fuels.” Public Citizen, December 22, 2021. <https://www.citizen.org/news/u-s-insurance-companies-have-582-billion-invested-in-fossil-fuels/>.

⁵ Adriano, Lyle. “Revealed – How Us Insurers Compare When It Comes to Exiting Fossil Fuel Support.” Insurance Business America, October 18, 2022. <https://www.insurancebusinessmag.com/us/news/environmental/revealed--how-us-insurers-compare-when-it-comes-to-exiting-fossil-fuel-support-424267.aspx>.

⁶ Frank, Thomas. “Fla. Insurance Crisis Deepens as Rates Soar, Companies Fall.” E&E News, September 21, 2022. <https://www.eenews.net/articles/fla-insurance-crisis-deepens-as-rates-soar-companies-fall/>; Finch II, Michael. “Louisiana’s Homeowners Insurance Market Straining under Weight of 600,000 Claims.” NOLA.com, April 2, 2022. https://www.nola.com/news/article_1aa57ff2-b205-11ec-8b04-5391d3bc8214.html.

⁷ Nadeau, Sarah, Julia Cusick & Madeline Shepherd. “Regulators Should Identify and Mitigate Climate Risks in the Insurance Industry.” Center for American Progress, June 5, 2023. <https://www.americanprogress.org/article/regulators-should-identify-and-mitigate-climate-risks-in-the-insurance-industry/>; Brooks, Christopher J. “California Insurers Are Dropping Homeowners Threatened by Wildfires.” CBS News, October 21, 2020. <https://www.cbsnews.com/news/california-wildfires-home-insurers-dropping-homeowners/>.

⁸ Frank, Thomas. “Are Home Insurers Abandoning Communities Vulnerable to Climate Change?” Scientific American, January 4, 2023. <https://www.scientificamerican.com/article/are-home-insurers-abandoning-communities-vulnerable-to-climate-change/>; Hussain, Noor Zainab. “State Farm Stops New Home Insurance Sales in California as Wildfire Risks Grow.” Reuters, May 30, 2023. <https://www.reuters.com/world/us/state-farm-stops-new-home-insurance-sales-california-wildfire-risks-grow-2023-05-30/>.

proposed collecting data to examine how climate risk and insurers' responses to it are affecting the cost and availability of insurance, including whether property insurance companies are withdrawing from the communities most vulnerable to climate change and, in doing so, further deepening systemic inequities.⁹

Furthermore, as states and municipalities seek damages from industrial polluters and other entities for cascading climate harms, many in the insurance industry are withdrawing from directors and officers liability coverage for defendants' alleged negligent or reckless acts in shareholder liability and tort lawsuits related to climate damage and fraud.¹⁰ Some insurers are also responding to increased climate-related claims by including clauses requiring policyholders to disclose climate risk, or by denying coverage for climate liability, costs, and losses where the insured party has failed to meet greenhouse gas emissions reduction targets.¹¹ Given the threat that climate change poses to both the insurance industry and its policyholders, it is difficult to understand how the industry can carefully price and manage climate risk in some areas of its business while simultaneously having no apparent plan to phase out its underwriting of and investment in the projects and companies generating the emissions that are causing these very harms. Many fossil fuel projects would not be able to move forward without insurance, and all industries and sectors in civil society have a role to play in meeting the United States' international climate goals.

In a related environmental justice issue, it remains unclear whether insurance providers, including your company, have adopted clear policies to ensure respect for Native sovereignty and other human rights when deciding whether to invest in or underwrite infrastructure projects.¹² Where polluting projects disproportionately impact Indigenous and other marginalized communities, the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples recommends that extractors "obtain their free and informed consent prior to the approval of any project affecting their lands or territories and other resources, particularly in connection with the development, utilization or exploitation of mineral, water or other resources."¹³ Consistent with that recommendation, the global insurer AXIS, for example, updated its human rights policy last

⁹ Frank, Thomas. "Are Home Insurers Abandoning Communities Vulnerable to Climate Change?" *Scientific American*, January 4, 2023. <https://www.scientificamerican.com/article/are-home-insurers-abandoning-communities-vulnerable-to-climate-change/>.

¹⁰ "US Fossil Fuel Firm Sues Insurer for Refusing to Cover Climate Lawsuit." *The Guardian*, August 30, 2022. <https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2022/aug/30/us-fossil-fuel-firm-aloha-petroleum-sues-insurer-aig-for-refusing-to-cover-climate-lawsuit>.

¹¹ "The Impact of Climate Change on the Insurance Sector." *Mishcon de Reya LLP*. February 7, 2023. <https://www.mishcon.com/news/the-impact-of-climate-change-on-the-insurance-sector>.

¹² "Climate Change for Indigenous Peoples." *United Nations*. Accessed June 6, 2023. <https://www.un.org/development/desa/indigenouspeoples/climate-change.html>.

¹³ *United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples*. September 13, 2007. https://www.un.org/development/desa/indigenouspeoples/wp-content/uploads/sites/19/2018/11/UNDRIP_E_web.pdf.

year to “not provide insurance coverage on projects undertaken on indigenous territories without Free, Prior, and Informed Consent.”¹⁴

Liberty Mutual sticks out as a key laggard that has taken few steps to restrict its underwriting of or investments in fossil fuel projects. While most large insurance companies have globally backed away from insuring new coal projects, Liberty Mutual continues to underwrite them, having adopted only a modest restriction on insuring and investing in some coal projects in 2019.¹⁵ For example, Liberty Mutual provided coverage to at least three coal power plants in Indonesia and Vietnam within the last five years.¹⁶

Furthermore, Liberty Mutual has not yet adopted any restrictions on underwriting oil and gas development and related projects.¹⁷ For example, your company underwrote Canada’s Trans Mountain Pipeline, which would ship 590,000 barrels-per-day of tar sands, some of the most carbon-intensive oil on Earth, to British Columbia.¹⁸ It has also not ruled out support for expansion of the controversial East African Crude Oil Pipeline Project (EACOP), which 22 insurance companies have already said they will not insure.¹⁹ Finally, according to California’s Department of Insurance, as of 2019, Liberty Mutual still held at least \$2.5 billion in fossil-fuel-related investments.²⁰

Given these concerns, we respectfully request that Liberty Mutual provide responses to the following requests for information by no later than June 16th, 2023:

¹⁴ Hussain, Noor Zainab & Simon Jessop. “Axis to Stop Insuring Energy, Other Projects without Community Support.” Reuters, October 14, 2022. <https://www.reuters.com/article/axis-capital-policy-esg-idCALIN31E1ST>.

¹⁵ “Liberty Mutual Insurance Appoints First Chief Sustainability Officer to Oversee Continued Development of Environmental, Social and Governance Agenda.” Liberty Mutual Insurance. PR Newswire: press release distribution, targeting, monitoring and marketing, December 13, 2019. <https://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/liberty-mutual-insurance-appoints-first-chief-sustainability-officer-to-oversee-continued-development-of-environmental-social-and-governance-agenda-300974652.html>.

¹⁶ “Insuring Our Future: 2020 Scorecard on Insurance, Fossil Fuels and Climate Change.” Insure Our Future, December 2020. <https://global.insure-our-future.com/wp-content/uploads/sites/2/2022/01/IOF-REPORT-FINAL-1-compressed.pdf>.

¹⁷ “Home.” Oil Gas Policy Tracker, May 2, 2023. <https://oilgaspolicytracker.org/>.

¹⁸ Stand.earth. Accessed June 6, 2023. <https://old.stand.earth/sites/stand/files/TMX-Insurance-Certificate.pdf>; Williams, Nia. “Trans Mountain Oil Pipeline Expansion Costs Surge 44% to C\$30.9 Billion.” Reuters, March 10, 2023. <https://www.reuters.com/business/energy/trans-mountain-oil-pipeline-expansion-costs-surge-44-c309-billion-2023-03-10/>.

¹⁹ “Ichthys LNG: Risky support from the insurance industry.” Reclaim Finance, October 2022. https://reclaimfinance.org/site/wp-content/uploads/2022/10/2022.10.05_Reclaim-Finance_Report_Ichthys-LNG-Risky-support-from-the-insurance-industry.pdf; “Insure Our Future, Not the EACOP: Who’s Backing the Pipeline and Who’s Ruled it Out?” #StopEACOP. Accessed June 6, 2023. <https://www.stopeacop.net/insurers-checklist>.

²⁰ State of California. Department of Insurance. Accessed June 6, 2023. https://interactive.web.insurance.ca.gov/apex_extprd/f?p=260:40:32696013527093::NO:10,20,30,40::; “Investing in Climate Chaos: North American Fossil Fuel Insurers’ Investments in Coal, Oil, and Gas.” Insure Our Future, July 2022. <https://us.insure-our-future.com/wp-content/uploads/sites/3/2022/07/Investing-in-Climate-Chaos-Brief.pdf>.

1. On what basis does Liberty Mutual still support underwriting new fossil fuel expansion projects and investing in the fossil fuel industry? Does Liberty Mutual have plans in place to follow the example of global counterparts and either scale back or phase out its underwriting of new and expanded coal, oil, and gas projects? If so, by when does Liberty Mutual plan to cease insuring such coal, oil and gas projects?
2. What methodology does Liberty Mutual use to evaluate its future impact on the environment and the climate as a result of its investment and underwriting decisions? What methodology does Liberty Mutual use to evaluate the impact of climate change on potential new and existing insured projects?
3. Does Liberty Mutual have a plan to ensure that its provision of insurance to oil, gas, and coal companies is in line with a credible 1.5°C pathway? If so, please explain that plan. If not, please explain why Liberty Mutual has chosen not to adopt such a plan.
4. Does Liberty Mutual plan to divest assets, including assets managed for third parties, from coal, oil and gas companies whose activities are not aligned with a 1.5°C pathway? If so, on what timeline or by what date?
5. Please provide a list of the trade associations, advocacy organizations, and lobbying entities with which Liberty Mutual has a professional relationship or membership as well as the amount of money that Liberty Mutual has spent on climate-related lobbying activities over each of the last five (5) years.
6. What is Liberty Mutual doing to evaluate its membership in those trade associations, funding of such advocacy organizations, and participation in lobbying activities, and to bring such advocacy in line with a 1.5°C pathway?
7. Does Liberty Mutual have a plan to adopt binding targets for reducing its insured emissions that are transparent, comprehensive and aligned with a credible 1.5°C pathway? If so, please explain.
8. How does Liberty Mutual evaluate its responsibilities with respect to the Free, Prior, and Informed Consent of Indigenous Peoples? Does Liberty Mutual have a plan for developing due diligence and verification mechanisms to ensure that both Liberty Mutual and its clients obtain and document the Free, Prior, and Informed Consent of impacted Indigenous Peoples as articulated in the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples? If so, please explain.

We also respectfully request that Liberty Mutual produce the following documents by no later than June 23rd, 2023:

1. Policies, memoranda, or other similar documents governing Liberty Mutual's methodology for conducting assessments of a project's impact on climate change or the environment when evaluating requests for investment in or underwriting of fossil fuel-related projects.

2. Policies, memoranda, or other similar documents concerning Liberty Mutual's methodology for evaluating the impact of climate change on its insured projects or projects considered for underwriting.
3. Policies, memoranda, or other similar documents reflecting Liberty Mutual's analysis or projections of the trajectory of insurance rates and scope of coverage in light of rising climate harms.
4. Policies, memoranda, or other similar documents concerning Liberty Mutual's plan, or lack thereof, to scale down or phase out insuring new and expanded coal, oil and gas projects.
5. Policies, memoranda, or other similar documents concerning Liberty Mutual's plan, or lack thereof, for divesting assets, including assets managed for third parties, from coal, oil and gas companies whose activities are not aligned with a 1.5°C pathway?
6. Policies, memoranda, or other similar documents concerning Liberty Mutual's methodology, or lack thereof, for evaluating existing or possible membership in trade associations, funding of advocacy organizations, and participation in lobbying activities, especially as such activities relate to the environment or climate change.
7. Policies, memoranda, or other similar documents concerning Liberty Mutual's adherence to—especially in connection with its underwriting or investing decisions—the UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples and/or the Free, Prior, and Informed Consent of Indigenous Peoples.

The latest Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) Report states that, to limit warming to 1.5 °C above pre-industrial levels, global emissions must halve by 2030. The planet has already warmed over 1.2°C above pre-industrial levels, and our ability to reach the 1.5°C goal is moving fast out of reach, with the IPCC pegging the current probability at just 38%. Maintaining the status quo would lead to a likely catastrophic 2.8°C temperature rise by the end of the century. The insurance and financial sectors have an important role to play.

Thank you for your attention to this important issue. We look forward to your responses and welcome further engagement with you on this topic.

* * *

The Senate Committee on the Budget has jurisdiction over Budget Act and budget process legislation, including concurrent resolutions on the budget and legislation changing the content or consideration of budget resolutions. In fulfilling its responsibilities, the Committee has broad authority to investigate the budgetary effects of existing and proposed legislation, as well as matters that affect the content or determination of amounts included in or excluded from the congressional budget or the calculation of such amounts, among other things. An attachment to

this letter provides additional instructions for responding to the Committee's request. If you have any questions regarding this request, please contact Majority Staff at (202) 224-0642.

Sincerely,



Sheldon Whitehouse
Chairman
Senate Committee on the Budget



Ron Wyden
United States Senator



Bernard Sanders
United States Senator